UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN Southern Division

Luis Gomez-Echeverria et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 1:22-cv-00314

Purpose Point Harvesting LLC et al.,

Defendants.

Hon. Jane M. Beckering

FINAL PRETRIAL ORDER

A final pretrial conference was held on the 22nd day of April 2025. Appearing for the parties as counsel were:

<u>Plaintiffs' Counsel</u>: Kenya Davis, Teresa Hendricks, Molly Spaak, Benjamin Solomon-Schwartz, Jessica Mugler, and Suleman Masood

Defendants' Counsel: Robert Anthony Alvarez Sr., Victor Jimenez, Kateri Dahl

Exhibits: The following exhibits will be offered by the plaintiffs and the defendants: *See* Attachment A.

Plaintiffs' Objections to Defendants' Exhibits:

Plaintiffs object to Defendants' inclusion of "Plaintiff's Original Complaint" and "Plaintiff's Amended Complaint- Class Action w/ Exhibits A-F" on their exhibit list, as Plaintiffs' Second Amended Complaint, ECF No. 56, is the operative complaint in this matter. Plaintiffs' previously-filed complaints are not operative pleadings and thus not relevant and more prejudicial than probative.

<u>Defendants' Objections to Plaintiffs' Exhibits</u>:

Defendants object to the following exhibits:

- JTX 0004 (Luis Gomez-Echeverria's H2A Passport Sticker April 2019)
- JTX 0021-A and 0021-B (Video Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Describing His Experiences at PPH, Showing Receipts from Shopping at Makkedah Meat

- Processing (June 2019) (Spanish); Transcription of Video of Luis Gomez-Echeverria Describing Experiences at PPH, Showing Receipts from Shopping at Makkedah Meat Processing (June 2019) (English & Spanish)
- JTX 0024-A, 0024-B, 0025-A, and 0025-B (Facebook Comments from Arnoldo Trabanino, Emilto Moreno, Taty Montemayor, and Luis Gomez (Spanish); Facebook Comments from Arnoldo Trabanino, Emilto Moreno, Taty Montemayor, and Luis Gomez (English); Facebook Comments from Luis' Father (Spanish); Facebook Comments from Luis Gomez-Echeverria Stating "He is Happily Retired" (English)
- JTX 0027 (Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Guatemalan Passport)
- JTX 0041 (Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement June 10 to June 16 2018)
- JTX 0054 (Darwin Fuentes Perez's Signed PPH Acknowledgement of H2A Obligations)
- JTX 0059-0064 (Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement May 6 to May 12 2018; Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement May 20 to May 26 2018; Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement June 17 to June 23 2018; Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement July 3 to July 9 2017; Prescription from Dr. Loren Reed for Darwin Fuentes Perez; Darwin Fuentes Perez's Form DS-160 (Visa Confirmation))
- JTX 0083 (Oceana County Property Tax Info Emilto and Lucille Gomez Moreno 2015 to 2017)
- JTX 0086 (Oceana County Sheriffs Police Report Emilto Gomez Moreno- 2021 FOIA response)
- JTX 0087 (MIOSHA Citation and Notification of Penalty to PPH February 08, 2023)
- JTX 0093 and 0094 (Indictment for United States v. Emilto Moreno Gomez; Judgment from U.S. v. Emilto Moreno Gomez)
- JTX 0095- 0104 (Jail Calls: November 10, 2021 December 11, 2021, Jail Calls: December 11, 2021 December 26, 2021; Jail Calls: December 26, 2021; Jail Calls: January 12, 2022 January 27, 2022; Jail Calls: January 27, 2022 February 9, 2022; Jail Calls: February 22, 2022; Jail Calls: February 22, 2022 March 11, 2022; Jail Calls: March 11, 2022 March 15, 2022; Jail Calls: March 16, 2022 March 29, 2022; Jail Calls: March 29, 2022 April 6, 2022)
- JTX 0109 and 0110 (Email Correspondence Between Lucille Jean Moreno and Worker's Accident Fund; Email Correspondence Between Lucille Jean Moreno and the Department of Labor)

- JTX 0114 (Picture of PPH Farm)
- Defendants object to JTX 0086, JTX 0087, JTX 0109, and 0110 under FRE 402, 403, and 404. The police report regarding Emilto has nothing to do with the present case and is likely to be highly prejudicial. Likewise, the MIOSHA citation is for a matter completely separate from Plaintiffs are alleging, and it would appear that Plaintiffs are attempting to slip in improper character evidence to establish that Defendants acted in a similar manner. Defendants object to the email correspondence exhibits of JTX 0109 and 0110. It is more than well established that courts have consistently held that evidence of unrelated misconduct must be excluded under FRE 402, 403, and 404. Other-act evidence is admissible only if it is probative of a material fact other than character or propensity—such as intent or knowledge—and its probative value is not substantially outweighed by unfair prejudice. Here, neither the MIOSHA citation nor the police report bears on any element of Plaintiffs' claims; instead, they are offered solely to cast Defendants in an unfair light. Admission of these exhibits would risk confusing the issues and prompting the jury to decide the case on an improper propensity basis. All of the named exhibits are blatantly irrelevant under Rule 402, have no bearing on any disputed fact, and should be excluded.
- Defendants object to JTX 0004, JTX 0021-A and 0021-B, JTX 0024-A, 0024-B, 0025-A, and 0025-B, JTX 0027, JTX 0041, JTX 0054, JTX 0059-0064, JTX 0083, and JTX 0114 on the basis that they were not produced by Plaintiffs during discovery. These exhibits were first disclosed in Plaintiffs' Pretrial Exhibit List, served well after the close of discovery, and none were ever produced in response to Defendants' Rule 26(a) disclosures, interrogatories, document requests, or subpoenas. Under Rule 37(c), "If a party fails to provide information or identify a witness as required by Rule 26(a) or (e), the party is not allowed to use that information or witness to supply evidence on a motion, at a hearing, or at a trial, unless the failure was substantially justified or is harmless." As a different circuit has helpfully noted, "Rule 37(c)(1) gives teeth to [disclosure] requirements by forbidding the use at trial of any information required to be disclosed," and exclusion is mandatory absent a showing of both justification and lack of prejudice. Yeti by Molly, Ltd. v. Deckers Outdoor Corp., 259 F.3d 1101, 1106 (9th Cir. 2001). Plaintiffs can offer no justification for this belated disclosure, and Defendants have been irreparably prejudiced—having had no opportunity to inspect, authenticate, or depose witnesses regarding these materials. Admission of these exhibits would unfairly surprise Defendants and disrupt trial preparation, and they must therefore be excluded.

- Defendants object to JTX 0093, JTX 0094, and JTX 0095- 0104 on both the basis of late disclosure and under FRE 402, 403, and 404. Not only were these documents never produced to Defendants, but based on the description provided by Plaintiffs, appear to be highly prejudicial and irrelevant. Defendants have not had an opportunity to review any of these exhibits, but they appear to pertain to Emilto Moreno's unrelated conviction. Defendants would repeat the objects for both late disclosure and under the aforementioned rules as previously discussed for the other exhibits.
- To the extent that Plaintiffs seek to submit social media posts, (such as JTX 0024-A and 0024-B, JTX 0025-A and 0025-B) Defendants object and would require a person with knowledge to testify as to the content of the post and the identity of the person who authored it. To the extent that the exhibit is authenticated, Defendants object to any hearsay contained therein, and would require redaction unless evidence is presented that a certain speaker in fact provided a specific response. *See* Paul W. Grimm, Daniel Capra, and Gregory P. Joseph, Authenticating Digital Evidence, 69 Baylor L. Rev. 1, at p. 31-32 (2017) Available at: https://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/faculty_scholarship/856 ("If the goal is to prove that the page or a post is that of a particular person, authenticity standards are not automatically satisfied by the fact that the post or the page is in that person's name, or that the person is pictured on the post. That is because someone can create a Facebook or other social media page in someone else's name. Moreover, one person may also gain access to another's account.").
- **Uncontroverted Facts:** The parties have agreed that the following may be accepted as established facts:

Defendants

- a. Purpose Point Harvesting, LLC ("Purpose Point") is a Michigan farm labor contracting corporation that relies on the H-2A program to find foreign workers to plant, maintain, and harvest crops on third party farms.
- b. Purpose Point was owned and operated at all relevant times by husband and wife, Emilto Moreno Gomez and Lucille Jean Moreno, who are residents of Michigan.
- c. From 2017-2019, Lucille was the secretary of Purpose Point.
- d. Emilto was the President of Purpose Point from 2017-2019.

- e. Both Lucille and Emilto profited financially from operating Purpose Point.
- f. Emilto supervised the work of Plaintiffs.
- g. Emilto had the authority and sole discretion to hire and fire Plaintiffs.
- h. Lucille performed a variety of tasks for Purpose Point including submitting applications to the USDOL ETA (United States Department of Labor and Employment and Talent Admin), including the form ETA-790 (also known as the employment contract).
- i. Lucille was responsible for completing payroll.

Recruitment Under the H-2A Program

- j. An H-2A visa is a temporary visa that a foreign worker receives that allows them to live and work in agriculture for a period of time in the U.S. The workers are sometimes referred to as "seasonal" or "H-2A" workers.
- k. The H-2A program is a federal program. The law requires agricultural employers in the United States to import foreign workers if the USDOL ETA certifies that:
 - 1. There are not enough U.S. workers to perform the job; and
 - 2. The employment of H-2A workers will not adversely affect the wages and working conditions of U.S. workers who are similarly employed.
- 1. Plaintiffs received H-2A visas, lawful work authorization and social security numbers for each season they worked for Purpose Point.
- m. The ETA-790 "employment contract" is a legal contract that contains the material terms and conditions of Plaintiffs' employment for each season worked in the United States.
- n. The employment contract at issue in this case contains a promise to "comply with applicable federal, state and local law regulations" that includes statutes raised in this matter, including the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (TVPRA), Michigan Human Trafficking Victims Compensation Act (MHTVCA), Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA), and the Michigan Workforce Opportunity Act (MWOWA).

Worker Living Conditions

- o. Plaintiffs lived in housing units owned by Purpose Point, which were located primarily in rural Oceana County.
- p. Plaintiffs had access to Dr. Loren Reed, a friend of Emilto and Lucille, to receive medical care, at times at his personal residence.

Plaintiffs

- q. Emilto and/or Lucille—on behalf of Purpose Point—arranged for Plaintiffs to enter the United States through the H-2A program.
- r. In 2017 and 2018, the work contract was certified by Defendant Emilto. In 2019, the work contracts were certified by Defendant Lucille.
- s. Plaintiffs are from an impoverished community in Guatemala.
- t. Plaintiffs were H-2A temporary agricultural workers who worked for Defendants in Oceana and Newaygo Counties in 2017, 2018, and 2019.
- u. Plaintiffs harvested, trimmed, maintained, and planted crops such as: asparagus, apples, peaches, tomatoes, cherries, broccoli, zucchini, and squash while working for Purpose Point.
- v. Darwin Fuentes Perez was employed by Defendants for the 2017, 2018, and 2019 seasons.
- w. Darwin signed an employment contract for each season he worked for Purpose Point.
- x. Luis Gomez Echeverria was employed by Defendants for the 2017, 2018, and 2019 seasons.
- y. Luis signed an employment contract for each season he worked for Purpose Point.
- z. Hervil Gomez Echeverria was employed by Defendants for the 2018 season.
- aa. Hervil signed an employment contract for each season he worked for Purpose Point.
- bb. Artemio Coronado Esteban was employed by Defendants for the 2018 season.
- cc. Artemio signed an employment contract for each season he worked for Purpose Point.
- dd. Leonel Lopez y Lopez was employed by Defendants for the 2017 and 2018 seasons.
- ee. Leonel signed an employment contract for each season he worked for Purpose Point.

Plaintiffs' Work During Each Season

- ff. Plaintiffs worked in groups while employed by Purpose Point. These groups changed from year to year, and sometimes groups would switch during the harvesting season.
- gg. Emilto selected and assigned workers to work in groups and selected an individual in each group to record hours and piece rates.
- hh. Defendants destroyed the records showing daily hours and piece rate production for 2018 and 2019.
- ii. Defendants did not document any problems with any Plaintiffs' work, attitude, or performance for any season they were employed by Purpose Point.
- jj. None of the farms contracted with Purpose Point ended their contract in 2020 as the result of any problems with Luis or Hervil.
- kk. Plaintiffs were not terminated for work misconduct, work slowdown or stoppage.

Compensation

- II. Under 20 CFR § 655.103, the employment contract, the employer must disclose all material aspects of the job. That includes: the hourly rate of pay the worker will receive, the piece rate, the housing sites where workers will live and field locations for work to be performed, the job start and end dates, as well as the expected number of hours to be worked for the season.
- mm. In their employment contracts, Defendants promised that each worker would earn at least the Adverse Wage Rate (AWER or "contract wage") or the prevailing hourly or piece rate wage or the federal or state minimum wage, whichever was higher at the time, for all hours worked in the payroll period. This is a federal requirement.
- nn. The contract wage in 2017 was \$12.75. The minimum wage in Michigan was \$8.90, and the Federal minimum wage was \$7.25.
- oo. The contract wage in 2018 was \$13.06. The minimum wage in Michigan was \$9.25, and the Federal minimum wage was \$7.25.
- pp. The contract wage in 2019 was \$13.54. The minimum wage in Michigan was \$9.45, and the Federal minimum wage was \$7.25.
- qq. Luis and Hervil were cousins to Emilto.

- rr. Hervil left his employment with Purpose Point prior to the end date of the contract.
- ss. Luis left his employment with Purpose Point prior to the end date of the contract.
- tt. Luis and Hervil left their employment without advance notice to Defendants.
- uu. The contract states that Defendants "will notify DOL (and DHS, in the case of an H2A worker)" of any workers who left their employment prior to the end date of the contract period.
- **Controverted Facts and Unresolved Issues:** The factual issues remaining to be determined and issues of law for the Court's determination are:

Compensation

- a. Plaintiffs dispute the accuracy of Defendants' timekeeping records required by the Fair Labor Standards ACT (FLSA), 29 U.S.C § 211 (c); 29 C.F.R Part 516.
- b. The parties dispute whether or not Luis Echeverria was adequately compensated for all hours worked for the 2017, 2018, and 2019 seasons. Luis asserts that he worked many hours for which he was not paid.
- c. The parties dispute whether or not Leonel Lopez was adequately compensated for all hours worked for the 2017 and 2018 seasons. Leonel asserts that he worked many hours for which he was not paid.
- d. The parties dispute whether or not Artemio Coronado was adequately compensated for all hours worked for the 2018 season. Artemio asserts that he worked many hours for which he was not paid.
- e. The parties dispute whether or not Hervil Echeverria was adequately compensated for all hours worked for the 2018 season. Hervil asserts that he worked many hours for which he was not paid.
- f. The parties dispute whether or not Darwin Fuentes was adequately compensated for all hours worked for the 2017, 2018, and 2019 seasons. Darwin asserts that he worked many hours for which he was not paid.
- g. The parties dispute that Defendants failed to pay the AWER, state minimum wage, and/or the federal minimum wage for all hours worked in 2017, 2018, and 2019.

Recruitment Fee

- h. Whether or not Defendants required Plaintiffs to pay a \$2,500 recruitment fee to Emilto, directly and/or through third parties, for the opportunity to work for the company in the United States each year, for the benefit of the company.
- i. Whether or not Luis paid the \$2,500 recruitment fees for the 2017, 2018, and 2019 seasons and \$2,500 for the 2020 season.
- j. Whether or not Emilto reimbursed Luis's recruitment fees each year.
- k. Whether or not Darwin paid the \$2,500 recruitment fee for 2017, 2018, and 2019 and \$1,500 towards the 2020 recruitment fee.
- 1. Whether or not Emilto reimbursed Darwin for the recruitment fees for 2017-2020.
- m. Whether or not, in 2017, 2018, and 2019, Emilto charged Leonel the \$2,500 recruitment fee.
- n. Whether or not Leonel paid the \$2,500 recruitment fee in 2017 and 2018, and paid the \$2,500 recruitment for the 2019 season, even though Emilto prohibited him from returning to work in 2019.
- o. Whether or not Emilto reimbursed Leonel for the recruitment fees paid in 2017, 2018, and 2019.
- p. Whether or not, in 2018, Emilto charged Hervil the \$2,500 recruitment fee.
- q. The parties dispute that to cover Hervil's recruitment fee for 2018, Lucille wrote two checks for herself from his brother and co-Plaintiff Luis's bank account with West Shore Bank in Hart, MI. These checks total \$2,500.
- r. The parties dispute that Defendants did not reimburse Plaintiffs their \$2,500 recruitment fee the first week of work contrary to their employment agreement and *Arriaga v. Fla Pacific Farms, LLC*, 305 F. 3d 1228, 1237 (11th Cir. 2002) ("Workers must be reimbursed during the first workweek for pre-employment expenses which primarily benefit the employer, to the point that wages are at least equivalent to the minimum wage.").
- s. Plaintiffs dispute that defendants breached their employment agreements by failing to compensate Plaintiffs for all hours worked for each season they worked.

Passport Confiscation and Control over Bank Accounts

- t. The parties dispute that Emilto confiscated Plaintiffs' passports and social security cards to ensure they could not travel or seek other employment.
- u. The parties dispute that Lucille had access to Plaintiffs' bank accounts to ensure workers paid whatever debts they owed to Emilto.
- v. Knowingly, concealing, removing, confiscating, or possessing any passport or social security card or other immigration or government document from an individual is, by definition, coercion under Michigan law (MCL 750.462a(b)(iii)).
- w. Whether for each season worked, Emilto recruited Plaintiffs in Guatemala and confiscated and possessed their passports upon arrival.
- x. Whether Emilto typically transported Plaintiffs to West Shore Bank in Hart, MI, and required them to open an account.
- y. Whether Lucille appears as an authorized user on several accounts.

Control Exerted Over Workers and Its Effects

- z. The parties dispute that Emilto warned Plaintiffs that he had friends with the Department of Labor (DOL) and threatened to "stain" workers' visas if they complained or cooperated with any investigation involving any agent from the state.
- aa. The parties dispute that, to avoid scrutiny, Emilto would not take injured or sick workers to established medical clinics unless absolutely necessary. Instead, Emilto would use a friend, Dr. Loren Reed, at Dr. Reed's personal residence.
- bb. The parties dispute that by underpaying workers, Defendants ensured that Plaintiffs could not afford to quit and by charging recruitment fees, workers were dependent on their jobs to earn the money back.
- cc. The parties dispute that Defendants' actions caused Plaintiffs serious harm including mental anguish including anxiety, worry, and apprehension.
- dd. The parties dispute that the Defendants required Plaintiffs to open a bank account.
- ee. The parties dispute that the Defendants required Plaintiffs to give Lucille access to their bank accounts or appear as signatory on their accounts.

- ff. Whether Plaintiffs had their own form(s) of transportation and were restricted to company controlled entities to meet basic needs such as, access to medical care, groceries, and check cashing.
- gg. Whether Plaintiffs had to rely on Emilto for exclusive access to the bank and international money wiring services.
- hh. Whether Plaintiffs were allowed to go to hospitals or urgent care centers.

4. <u>Witnesses</u>:

a. Non-expert witnesses to be called by the plaintiffs and defendants, except those who may be called for impeachment/rebuttal purposes only, are:

Name	Address, Tel. Number	Will Be / May Be Called	Method of Testimony	Objection(s)
Lucille Jean Moreno	c/o Avanti Law Group PLLC, 600 28th St. SW Wyoming, MI 49509 (616) 257-6807	Will be called	In person	
Emilto Moreno Gomez	c/o Avanti Law Group PLLC, 600 28th St. SW Wyoming, MI 49509 (616) 257-6807	Will be called	In person	
Luis Gomez- Echeverria	c/o Migrant Legal Aid, 1104 Fuller Ave., NE, Grand Rapids, MI 49503 (616) 454-5055	Will be called	In person	
Hervil Gomez- Echeverria	c/o Migrant Legal Aid, 1104 Fuller	Will be called	In person	

	Ave., NE, Grand Rapids, MI 49503 (616) 454-5055			
Darwin Joel Fuentes Perez	c/o Migrant Legal Aid, 1104 Fuller Ave., NE, Grand Rapids, MI 49503	Will be called	Video or in person	
Leonel Lopez y Lopez	c/o Migrant Legal Aid, 1104 Fuller Ave., NE, Grand Rapids, MI 49503 (616) 454-5055	Will be called	Video or in person	
Artemio Coronado Esteban	c/o Migrant Legal Aid, 1104 Fuller Ave., NE, Grand Rapids, MI 49503 (616) 454-5055	Will be called	Video or in person	
Dr. Loren Reed	71 Bevier St., Shelby, MI 49455 (231) 861-2187	May be called	In person	
Rubicelia Salgado	c/o Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity, 195 N. Michigan Ave., Shelby MI 49455	Will be called	In person	
Sherry Waller (Retail Banking Officer,	(517) 388-9056 c/o Westshore Bank, 4070 W Polk Rd, Hart, MI 49420	May be called	In person	

Westshore Bank)	(231) 873-1400			
Peggy Morales (Westshore Bank)	c/o Westshore Bank, 4070 W Polk Rd, Hart, MI 49420 (231) 873-1400	May be called	In person	
Naomi Marks (former PPH employee)	1813 N. 136th Ave., Hart, MI 49420	May be called	In person	
Nadine Marks (former PPH employee)	1813 N. 136th Ave., Hart, MI 49420	May be called	In person	
Rosa Rangel	1535 Industrial Park Dr. Hart, MI 4942 (231) 742-1395	Will be called	In person	

Additional Witnesses:

Defendants list an additional 80 witnesses that "may be called" via in person or video testimony. See the list below. Plaintiffs object to these 80 additional witnesses on the following grounds:

- This quantity of witnesses makes it impractical and unfeasible for Plaintiffs to properly prepare for trial and lends itself to surprise at trial. Further, it will result in needless presentation of cumulative evidence.
- Defendants did not notice these witnesses properly under Rule 26. Rule 26 requires parties to list the subjects of discoverable information of each individual. Fed. R. Civ. Proc. 26(a)(1)(A)(i). Defendants failed to list any subjects of information for any of these individuals when they served their disclosures. See ECF 210-2 at 2-5. On February 6, 2025, Plaintiffs sent a letter to Defendants' counsel requesting that counsel "supplement your disclosures with the names of persons you expect to call at trial, their addresses and phone numbers if known, and a description of the subjects of information you expect them to testify about and the basis of that testimony, and that you explain how that testimony complies

with the Court's MIL Order." Defendants refused to provide any further information. When pressed during pretrial meet-and-confer, Defendants provided only that: "These individuals may be called to testify as to their personal experiences with the Plaintiffs while working and living with them in 2017, 2018 and/or 2019." This late, vague description is insufficient.

"The discovery rules are designed to provide parties with essential information and to eliminate surprise." Miller v. Gentry, 2018 WL 11243682, at *3 (W.D. Mich. Apr. 25, 2018) (preventing witnesses from testifying at trial because Plaintiff did not adequately "describe the subject of the discoverable information the witnesses likely had"). Defendants should not be permitted to surprise Plaintiffs at trial with these 80 witnesses' testimonies. Under Rule 37(c), "If a party fails to provide information or identify a witness as required by Rule 26(a) or (e), the party is not allowed to use that information or witness to supply evidence on a motion, at a hearing, or at a trial, unless the failure was substantially justified or is harmless." Here, the omission of necessary subjects of information prejudiced Plaintiffs' trial preparation, and Defendants' should not be allowed to use the witnesses as evidence at trial. See Gipson v. Vought Aircraft Indus., Inc., 387 F. App'x 548, 554 (6th Cir. 2010) (affirming the striking of an affidavit because subjects of information omitted information and thus harmed trial preparation, since the omission "certainly 'suggested to [defendants] that such investigation [of omitted information] might have been a waste of resources" (quoting Caudell v. City of Loveland, 226 Fed. App'x 479, 481 (6th Cir. 2007)).

- Elia Gomez de Moreno was not previously listed on any disclosures from Defendants.
- Defendants appear to be completely ignoring the Court's order at ECF 219, in which the Court ruled on Plaintiffs' motion in limine regarding these very witnesses and found that "to the extent that Defendants seek to introduce testimony from non-Plaintiff Purpose Point workers that goes beyond their personal knowledge of Plaintiffs' experiences with Defendants, that testimony is properly excluded as irrelevant under Rule 401 of the Federal Rules of Evidence" and "is also properly excluded under Rule 403 of the Federal Rules of Evidence." ECF 219 at 15-18. Defendants have not even attempted to identify which—if any—of these 80 additional witnesses worked in the same crews as Plaintiffs for any specific year.
- Defendants failed to move the Court for allowance of video testimony for any of these 80 additional witnesses. Particular provisions have to be in place for

witnesses to appear via video, and Defendants have established none of these. Plaintiffs were granted permission for certain Plaintiffs to testify remotely only after they made a motion to the Court — *which Defendants opposed* — for remote testimony and established good-faith efforts to obtain requisite visas to testify in-person. ECF 219 at 14-15. The parties then met and conferred on procedures for Plaintiffs' remote testimony, which they presented to the Court. ECF 237. By contrast, at no point before yesterday were Plaintiffs made aware of Defendants' intentions to call any witness remotely.

Names	Address	Phone	Will be/May	Method of
		Numbers	Be Called	Testimony
Alber Elpidio	Aldea Olvido Malacatan	502-3987-3139	May be called	In Person
Merida Avila	San Marcos Guatemala			
Aldair Lopez	Aldea Esquipulas	502-4908-8636	May be called	In Person
Orozco	Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala			
Alejandro J	134 W. Church St.	704-761-9167	May be called	In Person
Natareno Valdez	Troutman N.C. 28166			
Ana Isabel	Aldea Esquipulas	470-448-7363	May be called	Via Video
Hernandez Chilel	Malacatan San Marcos			
	Guatemala			
Angel Heraldo	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3390-1281	May be called	Via Video
Moreno Gomez	Malacatan San Marcos			
	Guatemala			
Ariel Perez Ramos	Aldea La Batalla	502-4874-7944	May be called	In Person
	Malacatan San Marcos			
	Guatemala			
Bagner Uriver Leal	Aldea Sinai Malacatan San	502-4683-8940	May be called	In Person
Barrios	Marcos Guatemala			
Belarmino Gomez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San	502-4950-3054	May be called	Via Video
Soto	Marcos Guatemala			
Boris Oman Lopez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San	502-4040-4743	May be called	In Person
Chavez	Marcos Guatemala			
Brandon Alexis de	Aldea Nica Malacatan San	502-5778-6310	May be called	In Person
Leon Gomez	Marcos Guatemala			
Bridman Uriver	Aldea Esquipulas	502-5375-2058	May be called	In Person
Gomez-Moreno	Malacatan San Marcos			
	Guatemala			
Byron Danny Chilel	Aldea Nica Malacatan San	502-4042-9886	May be called	In Person
	Marcos Guatemala			

Carlos Alberto De Leon Lopez	Aldea San Juan Melendrez Catarina San Marcos Guatemala	502-3996-9254	May be called	In Person
Cesar Ruben Lopez Perez	Aldea Sinai Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3849-8134	May be called	In Person
Clisman Romeo Merida Avila	Aldea Olvido Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4050-6889	May be called	In Person
Cristian Santiago Felix-Bamaca	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4054-0445	May be called	Via Video
Cupertino Lopez Moreno	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5757-2891	May be called	In Person
Dagoberto Garcia- Perez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5317-5360	May be called	In Person
Daniel Domingo Felipe Chilel	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4956-3706	May be called	Via Video
Darsi Elisa Moreno Bamaca	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4896-3129	May be called	Via Video
David Alex Gomez- Perez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5154-0546	May be called	In Person
Deibin Belarmino Gomez-Zacarias	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5362-7027	May be called	In Person
Drodsni Rodmimi Laparra Solis	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3707-8036	May be called	In Person
Eder Waldemar Echeverria-Arriaga	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3254-6094	May be called	In Person
Edy Cruz Dionicio Barrios	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5324-8983	May be called	Via Video
Elfego Rosinel Lopez-Guzman	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala		May be called	Via Video
Elia Gomez de Moreno.	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4898-3452	May be called	In Person
Elvis Eudelio Lopez-Orozco	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4822-6423	May be called	In Person
Enma Lidy Munoz Diaz	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4545-2840	May be called	Via Video

Erasmo Alexander Ramirez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala		May be called	Via Video
Ergil Miguel Gomez Navarro	Aldea El Rubi Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3702-5794	May be called	In Person
Ervin Danilo De Leon Lopez	Aldea San Juan Melendrez Catarina San Marcos Guatemala	502-5524-6593	May be called	In Person
Estuardo Rene Rivera-Barrios	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3713-9949	May be called	In Person
Eugenio Perez- Pablo	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4557-2769	May be called	In Person
Favio Moreno Trabanino	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3827-9675	May be called	In Person
Feliciano Adrian Lopez-Ramos	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4803-0444	May be called	Via Video
Franklin Romario Ramirez-Lopez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4953-8923	May be called	In Person
Fredy Yovani Fuentes Osorio	16538 San Fernando Mission BLVD San Fernando Ca. 91340	818-321-4988	May be called	Via Video
Genaro Rodrigo Echeverria Arriaga	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4894-0874	May be called	In Person
Guillermo Agusto Orozco-Orozco	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4694-9293	May be called	In Person
Horge Ottoniel Merida Barrios	Aldea Olvido Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4564-4015	May be called	In Person
Isael Hernandez Hernandez	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-765-105- 8123	May be called	In Person
Jesus Alexander Lopez Guzman	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5734-3160	May be called	In Person
Jesus Enrique Garcia-Gomez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5521-2711	May be called	Via Video
Jezer Jeudi Bonilla- Barrios	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4918-7978	May be called	Via Video

Jose Benigno	Aldea Nica Malacatan San		May be called	Via Video
Romero-Felipe	Marcos Guatemala		iviay oc canca	via viaco
Jose Manuel	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-746-106-	May be called	Via Video
Cabrera Gutierrez	Thamo vera craz wiexieo	1160	iviay be called	via viaco
Juan Alberto Garcia	Aldea Esquipulas	502-5181-1935	May be called	In Person
Perez	Malacatan San Marcos	302 3101 1733	iviay oc canca	in i cison
1 CICE	Guatemala			
Juan Alberto Osorio	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-765-110-	May be called	In Person
Antonio	7 Hamo Vera Cruz Mexico	8210	iviay be called	in i cison
Juan Valentin	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3724-3877	May be called	In Person
Gomez Y Gomez	Malacatan San Marcos	302 3721 3077	iviay oc canca	in i cison
Goinez i Goinez	Guatemala			
Julio Ceasar Gomez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San		May be called	Via Video
Moreno	Marcos Guatemala		iviay be called	via viaco
Kembirle Minerva	Aldea Esquipulas	502-5375-2058	May be called	Via Video
Ambrocio Perez	Malacatan San Marcos	302-3313-2030	iviay oc cancu	via video
Amorocio i cicz	Guatemala			
Keny Orlando	Aldea Esquipulas	502-4899-1254	May be called	In Person
Moreno Gomez	Malacatan San Marcos	302-4077-1234	Way be called	III I CISOII
Wiorcho Gomez	Guatemala			
Koeman Anibal	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3847-3505	May be called	In Person
Lopez Alonzo	Malacatan San Marcos	302-30-7-3303	Way be called	III I CISOII
Lopez Alolizo	Guatemala			
Lesvy M Lopez	Aldea Esquipulas	502-5534-6681	May be called	In Person
Ramirez	Malacatan San Marcos	302-3334-0001	Way be called	III I CISOII
Raimicz	Guatemala			
Mario Adolfo	Aldea Esquipulas	502-5199-8973	May be called	In Person
Moreno	Malacatan San Marcos	302 3177 0773	iviay be called	in i cison
Wioreno	Guatemala			
Mayron Estuardo	El Progreso Jutiapa	502-5895-6472	May be called	In Person
Linares Flores	Guatemala	302 3073 0172	iviay be called	in i cison
Mefibocet Moralas	Aldea Nica Malacatan San	502-3119-8742	May be called	In Person
De Paz	Marcos Guatemala	302 3117 0712	iviay be called	in i cison
Melvin Hermitalio	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3376-7596	May be called	Via Video
Mendez-Fuentes	Malacatan San Marcos	302 3310 1370	iviay oc canca	via viaco
Wichaez Tachtes	Guatemala			
Oscar Gerardo	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3838-3721	May be called	In Person
Gomez-Lopez	Malacatan San Marcos	002 0000 0721	linaj or carrod	111 1 015011
Zomez zopez	Guatemala			
Pablo Cruz Perez	Aldea Esquipulas	502-3733-0994	May be called	In Person
Solis	Malacatan San Marcos	302 3733 0774	litaj de daned	111 1 015011
20110	Guatemala			
Patricio Adrian	Aldea Olvido Malacatan	502-4663-6480	May be called	In Person
Merida-Avila	San Marcos Guatemala	302 1003 0400	lita, be called	111 1 015011
TVICITUA / IVIIA	Sun Maicos Guatemara		<u> </u>	l

Peggy Morales	4070 W. Polk Rd. Hart MI 49420	231-873-1400	May be called	In Person
Penny Burillo	516 Griswold St. Hart, MI 49420	231-239-4058	May be called	In Person
Raul Navarro Moreno	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-765-114- 5150	May be called	In Person
Roberth Raul De Leon Arreaga	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4959-9425	May be called	In Person
Roberto Garcia Rivera	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-765-119- 3240	May be called	In Person
Roger Ademir De Leon Arreaga	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4896-3129	May be called	In Person
Rosalinda Ruiz	508 E Court St. Ludington MI 49431	231-233-9069	May be called	In Person
Rudy Waldemar Chilel-Lopez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4562-2800	May be called	In Person
Sadi Osael Renoj Lopez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala		May be called	Via Video
Saul Segura Olivares	Alamo Vera Cruz Mexico	52-765-112- 2664	May be called	In Person
Sayra Karina de Leon Cifuentes	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala		May be called	Via Video
Sergio Valente Perez Martinez	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5900-8738	May be called	In Person
Sirle Odali Moreno Bamaca	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4956-3786	May be called	Via Video
Tony-Ferdy Moreno-Bamaca	Aldea Nica Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-4532-0684	May be called	In Person
Victor Elias Gomez- Leal	Aldea Sinai Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-5185-0626	May be called	In Person
Wilmar Alfredo Moreno Gomez	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3384-8473	May be called	In Person
Wilson Antulio Lopez-Moreno	Aldea Maria Linda Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala		May be called	Via Video
Yener-Didier Gomez-Moreno	Aldea Esquipulas Malacatan San Marcos Guatemala	502-3290-6419	May be called	Via Video

a. Expert witnesses to be called by the plaintiffs and the defendants, except those who may be called for impeachment purposes only, are:

Name	Address, Tel. Number	Qualifications and Field	Method of Testimony	Objection(s)
Dr. Kim Mehlman- Orozco	(703) 362- 9405	Dr. Mehlman-Orozco has expert knowledge on the subject of human trafficking in general and forced labor offender practices in particular. Judges in both federal and state courtrooms have found Dr. Mehlman-Orozco to be a highly qualified and reliable expert. In addition, Dr. Mehlman-Orozco has conducted over 2,000 qualitative interviews with human traffickers and victims, has trained both federal and local level law enforcement agents on the methodology of identifying geographic patterns of human trafficking, and has a number of peer-reviewed publications on trafficking. Additionally, Dr. Mehlman-Orozco. <i>See</i> ECF No. 226-1 at PageID.5814-5815; ECF No. 226-2 at PageID.5830-5849.	In person	Subject of pending motion. See ECF Nos. 226, 231.

Depositions and Other Discovery Documents: All depositions, answers to written interrogatories, and requests for admissions, or portions thereof, that are expected to be offered in evidence by the plaintiffs and the defendants are:

Plaintiffs:

- a. Plaintiffs' Answers To Defendant's First Set Of Interrogatories Response to Interrogatory No. 2
- b. Plaintiffs' Answers To Defendant's Request To Produce Response to Request No. 15
- c. Plaintiffs' Answers To Defendant's First Interrogatories For Plaintiffs Julio Cesar Gomez Moreno, Darwin Joel Fuentes Perez, Artemio Coronado Esteban, Leonel Lopez Y Lopez Response to Interrogatory No. 2
- d. Plaintiffs' Answers To Defendant's First Request To Plaintiffs Julio Cesar Gomez Moreno, Darwin Joel Fuentes Perez, Artemio Coronado Esteban, And Leonel

Lopez Y Lopez For Production, Inspection, And Copying Of Documents And Things - Response to Request No. 15

Defendants:

- a. None.
- **Length of Trial:** Counsel estimate the trial will last approximately 7 full days, allocated as follows: 3 days for plaintiffs' case; 3 days for defendants' case; 1 day for plaintiffs' rebuttal.
- 7. **Prospects of Settlement:** The current status of settlement negotiations is:

On April 8, 2025, defense counsel emailed counsel for Plaintiffs with a settlement offer. Plaintiffs shared this offer with their clients and are considering a response.

Dated: April 15, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP

/s/ Kenya K. Davis

Kenya K. Davis (D.C. Bar No: 502305)
Admitted to Practice in the Western District of Michigan
1401 New York Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Tel: (202) 237-9608

kdavis@bsfllp.com

MIGRANT LEGAL AID

Teresa Hendricks (P46500) 1140 Fuller Ave., NE Grand Rapids, MI 49503 Tel: (616) 454-5055 thendricks@migrantlegalaid.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

AVANTI LAW GROUP, PLLC

/s/ Robert Anthony Alvarez
Robert Anthony Alvarez (P66954)
600 28th St. SW
Wyoming, MI 49509
Tel: (616) 257-6807
ralvarez@avantilaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants

IT IS SO ORDERED subject to the rulings and directions provided on the record at the Final Pretrial Conference held April 22, 2025.

Dated: May 1, 2025 /s/ Jane M. Beckering
Hon. Jane M. Beckering

United States District Judge

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0001	N/A	Demonstrative Exhibit of July 2019 PPH Employee Pay Summary (Includes Plaintiffs Luis & Darwin Fuentes Perez)				
JTX 0002	N/A	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Deposition				
JTX 0003	N/A	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's 2017 Visa				
JTX 0004	MLA000589	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's H2A Passport Sticker April 2019				
JTX 0005	000012	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's H2A Passport with Immigration Stamps (from 2017 and 2018)				
JTX 0006	000016	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's I-94 Record - Departures and Arrivals with Dates (2017-2019)				
JTX 0007	PPL002367-002375	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Signed Work Agreement - 2017				
JTX 0008	PPL01894-001903	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Signed Work Agreement - 2018				
JTX 0009	PPL003527-003542	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Signed Work Agreement - 2019				
JTX 0010	000341	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Bank Account Agreement				
JTX 0011	000344	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Bank Debit Slips & Checks (2017-2019)				
JTX 0012	000342-343	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Bank - Credit Slips & Checks (07/2017-09/2019)				
JTX 0013	N/A	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Bank Checks January and March 2018				
		Luis Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Bank Checking Account Statements				
JTX 0014	MLA000602-MLA000665	(August 2017 - December 2019)				
JTX 0015	PPL003525-PPL003558	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Profile - PPH Papers, Passport, Photo IDs, I-9, SSN, W-4				
JTX 0016	PPL004161, PPL004165, PPL004171, PPL004175, PPL004177, PPL004177, PPL004187, PPL004187, PPL004208, PPL004205, PPL004208, PPL004212, PPL004206, PPL004224, PPL004228, PPL004223, PPL004237, PPL004239, PPL004239, PPL004239, PPL004239, PPL004253, PPL004253, PPL004253, PPL004254	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Timesheets (from 04/30/19-10/05/19)				
JTX 0017	PPL004265, 004271, 004274, 004281	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Timesheets (from 10/06/19-11/02/19)				
JTX 0018	PPL001714-001733	Luis Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Paystubs June 19 2017 to November 05 2017				
JTX 0019	PPL 000947-PPL000975	Luis Eduardo Gomez-Echeverria PPH Paystubs May 06 2018 to April 12 2019				
JTX 0020	PPL 005511-005538	Luis Gomez-Echeverria PPH Paystubs April 21 2019 November 1 2019				
JTX 0021-A	MLA-000788	Video - Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Describing His Experiences at PPH, Showing Receipts from Shopping at Makkedah Meat Processing (June 2019) (Spanish)				
JTX 0021-B	MLA-000788	Transcription of Video of Luis Gomez-Echeverria Describing Experiences at PPH, Showing Receipts from Shopping at Makkedah Meat Processing (June 2019) (English & Spanish)				
JTX 0022-A	000008	Texts Between Luis Gomez-Echeverria and State Trooper McMaster (Spanish)				
JTX 0022-B	800000	Texts Between Luis Gomez-Echeverria and State Trooper McMaster (English Translation)	1			

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0023-A	000013	Facebook: Raymundo Reyes's Facebook Post of Plaintiffs Stating They are Missing (Spanish)				
JTX 0023-B	000013	Facebook: Raymundo Reyes's Facebook Post of Plaintiffs Stating They are Missing (English)				
JTX 0024-A	MLA000571-MLA000573	Facebook Comments from Arnoldo Trabanino, Emilto Moreno, Taty Montemayor, and Luis Gomez (Spanish)				
JTX 0024-B	MLA000571-MLA000573	Facebook Comments from Arnoldo Trabanino, Emilto Moreno, Taty Montemayor, and Luis Gomez (English)				
JTX 0025-A	MLA000574	Facebook Comments from Luis' Father (Spanish)				
JTX 0025-B	MLA000574	Facebook Comments from Luis Gomez-Echeverria - Stating "He is Happily Retired" (English)				
JTX 0026	N/A	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Deposition				
JTX 0027	MLA000577	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Guatemalan Passport	1		1	
JTX 0028	000018	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's SSN	 	—	 	
JTX 0029	000014-15	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's I-94 Stamps	 	†	 	
JTX 0030	000558	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's West Shore Account Agreement	 	†	1	
JTX 0031	559-579	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Westshore Bank Records from 2018-2019				
017(0001		Hervil Gomez-Echeverna's Westshole Bank Records from 2010-2019 Hervil Gomez-Echeverna's - Mercy Health Doctor's Note Explaining Absence	_			
JTX 0032	PPL002365	(June 20 to July 01 2018)				
JTX 0033	PPL002507- 002509	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Doctor's Note and Bill for Surgical I&D on June 21-22, 2018				
JTX 0034	MLA000575	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Workplace Injury Open Wound 1				
JTX 0035	000009	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Workplace Injury Open Wound 2	 	<u> </u>		
JTX 0036	000010	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Workplace Injury Gauzed Up 3				
JTX 0037	000011	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Workplace Injury Gauzed Up 4	 	+	1	
JTX 0038	PPL000716-PPL000734	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Paystubs May 18 to September 28 2018				
JTX 0039	000001	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement May 6 to May 12 2018				
JTX 0040	000002	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement May 20 to May 26 2018				
JTX 0041	MLA000579	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement June 10 to June 16 2018				
JTX 0042	000004	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement June 17 to June 23 2018				
JTX 0043	000005	Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's PPH Wage Statement June 24 to June 30 2018	 	<u> </u>		
JTX 0044	000003	PPH Wage Statement with top half cut off - Presumably Hervil Gomez-Echeverria (Shows Net Pay and Date Paid)				
JTX 0045	PPL002366	Letter from PPH reporting AWOL Worker to Dept of Labor on Hervil Gomez-Echeverria				
JTX 0046	000414	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Guatemalan Passport				
JTX 0047	N/A	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Deposition				
JTX 0048	PPL002235- 002346	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Signed Worker Agreement 2018 (Spanish)	 	†	 	
JTX 0049	PPL002376- 002383	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Signed Worker Agreement 2017 (Spanish)	 	 	 	
JTX 0050	000427	Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Account Agreement	+	 	 	
JTX 0051	000344	Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Account Agreement Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Debit and Check Slips 2017-2019	+	 	 	
JTX 0052	MLA000566-MLA000567	Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Credit and Check Slips	+	 	 	
JTX 0052	000349	Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Checking Account Statement October 2019	+	 	+ +	
JTX 0053	MLA000561	Darwin Fuentes Perez's West Shore Bank Checking Account Statement October 2019 Darwin Fuentes Perez's Signed PPH Acknowledgement of H2A Obligations	+	-	 	
JTX 0054	PPL004057- 004090	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Signed PPH Acknowledgement of HzA Obligations Darwin Fuentes Perez's Profile of PPH Papers, Photo IDs, SSN, MI-W4, I-94, H2A	+	-	 	
317 0033	PPL001754- 001773	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Profile of PPH Papers, Photo IDs, SSN, MI-W4, I-94, H2A Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Paystubs June 19 to November 05 2017				

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0057	PPL00276 -PPL00303	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Paystubs May 06 2018 to April 12 2019	i			
JTX 0058	PPL004867- 004895	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Paystubs April 21 to November 11 2019	1	i e		
JTX 0059	MLA000562	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement May 6 to May 12 2018				
JTX 0060	MLA000563	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement May 20 to May 26 2018				
JTX 0061	MLA000564	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement June 17 to June 23 2018				
JTX 0062	MLA000565	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Wage Statement July 3 to July 9 2017				
JTX 0063	MLA000568	Prescription from Dr. Loren Reed for Darwin Fuentes Perez				
JTX 0064	MLA000560	Darwin Fuentes Perez's Form DS-160 (Visa Confirmation)				
JTX 0065	PPL002376- 002383	Darwin Fuentes Perez's PPH Signed Work Agreement June 2017				
JTX 0066-A	PPL006395, PPL006404, PPL006401, PPL006397	Text Messages Between the Department of Labor and Darwin Fuentes (Spanish)				
JTX 0066-B	PPL006395, PPL006404, PPL006401, PPL006397	Text Messages Between the Department of Labor and Darwin Fuentes (English)				
JTX 0067	N/A	Artemio Coronado's Deposition			 	
JTX 0068	PPL002095- 002104	Artemio Cornoado's Signed Work Agreement April 30 2018			 	
JTX 0069	PPL000030- 000056	Artemio Coronado's PPH Paystubs May 06 2018 to April 12 2019			 	
JTX 0070	N/A	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Deposition				
JTX 0071	000420	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's SSN				
JTX 0072	ECF 000419	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Guatemalan Passport				
JTX 0073	ECF 000493	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Westshore Bank Account Agreement				
JTX 0074	ECF 000558	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Westshore Debit Card				
JTX 0075	ECF 000494- 000495	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Westshore Bank Cashed Checks July 2017 to October 2018				
JTX 0076	MLA000713-MLA000773	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Westshore Bank Statements (August 2017 - December 2019)				
JTX 0077	000496	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Westshore Bank Cashed Checks November 2017, May 2018, and November 2018				
JTX 0078	PPL001884- 001893	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's PPH Signed Work Agreement (2017)				
JTX 0079	PPL001884- 001893	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's PPH Signed Work Agreement (2018)				
JTX 0080	PPL001576- 001595	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's PPH Paystubs June 19 2017 to November 5 2017	1			
JTX 0081	PPL000922- 000946	Leonel Lopez y Lopez's PPH Paystubs May 13 2018 to April 12 2019				
JTX 0082	PPL002368-003474	Section 8 of PPH Contracts - Signed by Leonel Lopez, Darwin Fuentes, Julio Cesar Gomez, Artemio Coronado, and Luis Gomez-Echeverria				
JTX 0082	MLA000667	Oceana County Property Tax Info - Emilto and Lucille Gomez Moreno 2015 to 2017	-	-	-	
	PPL002496- 002505	Department of Labor Notice of Determination of Wages Owed				
JTX 0084 JTX 0085	000264- 000280	- Sent to Emilto and Lucille Gomez Moreno Mishinga Persona Report filed by Emilto Comez Morena	+	-	⊢	
JTX 0085	000204-000200	Michigan Department of State Police - Missing Persons Report filed by Emilto Gomez Moreno	+	 	 	
JTX 0086 JTX 0087	PPL002488- 002495	Oceana County Sheriffs Police Report - Emilto Gomez Moreno- 2021 FOIA response		<u> </u>	 	
*******	000287-000314	MIOSHA Citation and Notification of Penalty to PPH February 08, 2023		 	 	
JTX 0088	000287-000314	U.S. Department of Labor Wage & Hour Division - Compliance Action Report (2018)				
JTX 0089	000315-000340	U.S. Department of Labor Wage & Hour Division - Compliance Action Report (2019)				-
JTX 0090	000021-000029	U.S. Department of Labor FOIA Response Sent by the Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity				
JTX 0091	000030-000034	FOIA Response- Request Sent by MLA to the Michigan Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity				
JTX 0092	000035-000039	FOIA Response- Request Sent by MLA to the Department of Labor Wage and Hour Division				
JTX 0093	MLA000789-MLA000790	Indictment for United States v. Emilto Moreno Gomez				

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0094	MLA000774-MLA000777	Judgment from U.S. v. Emilto Moreno Gomez		1		
JTX 0095	MLA000778	Jail Calls: November 10, 2021 - December 11, 2021		i e		
JTX 0096	MLA000779	Jail Calls: December 11, 2021 - December 26, 2021				
JTX 0097	MLA000780	Jail Calls: December 26, 2021				
JTX 0098	MLA000781	Jail Calls: January 12, 2022 - January 27, 2022				
JTX 0099	MLA000782	Jail Calls: January 27, 2022 - February 9, 2022		i e		
JTX 0100	MLA000783	Jail Calls: February 9, 2022 - February 22, 2022				
JTX 0101	MLA000784	Jail Calls: February 22, 2022 - March 11, 2022				
JTX 0102	MLA000785	Jail Calls: March 11, 2022 - March 15, 2022				
JTX 0103	MLA000786	Jail Calls: March 16, 2022 - March 29, 2022				
JTX 0104	MLA000787	Jail Calls: March 29, 2022 - April 6, 2022				
JTX 0105	N/A	Lucille Jean Moreno's Deposition				
JTX 0106	N/A	Emilto Gomez Moreno's Deposition				
JTX 0107	N/A	Front and Back of Checks Drawn on Luis Gomez Echeverria's Account		i i		
JTX 0108	PPL002513- 002516	Checking and Banking Information (crossed out) on PPH Employees with Lucille Moreno		1		
JTX 0109	PPL002480- 002487	Email Correspondence Between Lucille Jean Moreno and Worker's Accident Fund		1		
JTX 0110	PPL002549- 002608	Email Correspondence Between Lucille Jean Moreno and the Department of Labor				
JTX 0111	N/A	Two Checks Addressed to Luis Gomez-Echeverria Endorsed by Lucille Jean Moreno				
JTX 0112	PPL004569-PPL005126	PPH Paystubs of Various Workers from 2019 (Includes Darwin Fuentez Perez's Paystub from 07-12-19 and 07-19-19				
JTX 0113	PPL005137-PPL005677	PPH Paystubs of Various Workers from 2019 (Includes Luis Gomez-Echeverria's Paystubs from 07-12-2019 to 08-09-19				
JTX 0114	MLA000700	Picture of PPH Farm				
JTX 0115	PPL005703-PPL006125	PPH Paystubs of Non-Plaintiff Workers from 2019				
JTX 0116	N/A	ETA Department of Labor 790 Form filled out by PPH (2019)				
JTX 0117	N/A	ETA Department of Labor 790 Form filled out by PPH (2018)				
JTX 0118	N/A	ETA Department of Labor 790 Form filled out by PPH (2017)				
JTX 0119	N/A	List of PPH Workers with Information on Familial Relation, Reports Filed, and other Information Given				
JTX 0120	PPL002517- 002518	Employee ID Numbers under PPH Employee Contact List				
JTX 0121	PPL004364-PPL004415	PPH Invoices to Farms				
JTX 0122	PPL002609- 002622	Contract between PPH and Oomen Brothers Inc. on January 01, 2018				
JTX 0123	PPL002733- 002737	Contract between PPH and Brandel Farms LLC on December 26, 2018				
JTX 0124	PPL002727- 002731	Contract between PPH and BW Orchards LLC on December 10, 2018				
JTX 0125	PPL002721- 002725	Contract between PPH and Crystal Valley Organics on November 28, 2018				
JTX 0126	PPL002715- 002719	Contract between PPH and Daly Orchard Company on December 04, 2018	İ	ĺ		
JTX 0127	PPL002709- 002713	Contract between PPH and Eisenlohr Farms LLC on November 30, 2018		1		
JTX 0128	PPL002703- 002707	Contract between PPH and Eugene Kokx Farms LLC on December 08, 2018		1		
JTX 0129	PPL002697- 002701	Contract between PPH and Evans Farms on December 01, 2018				
JTX 0130	PPL002691- 002695	Contract between PPH and Four Star Farms on February 11, 2019	T i	1		
JTX 0131	PPL002685- 002689	Contract between PPH and Gerald and Rusty Shafer Inc. on December 08, 2018		1		
JTX 0132	PPL002679- 002683	Contract between PPH and Greiner Farms LLC December 07, 2018		1		
JTX 0133	PPL002673- 002677	Contract between PPH and Happy Acres on November 27, 2018				
JTX 0134	PPL002667- 002671	Contract between PPH and Lakeshore Farms Inc. on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0135	PPL002661- 002665	Contract between PPH and Matt Williams on November 24, 2018		1		
JTX 0136	PPL002655- 002659	Contract between PPH and Oomen Brothers Inc. on December 12, 2018		1		

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0137	PPL002649- 002653	Contract between PPH and Oomen Farms on November 28, 2018			i i	
JTX 0138	PPL002739- 002743	Contract between PPH and Red Barn LLC on December 10, 2018				
JTX 0139	PPL002643- 002647	Contract between PPH and Rennhack Orchards LLC on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0140	PPL002636- 002640	Contract betwwen PPH and Robert Bush Farms on Decmeber 06, 2018				
JTX 0141	PPL002630- 002634	Contract between PPH and Veg Grass LLC on December 11, 2018				
JTX 0142	PPL002623- 002628	Contract between Wittkamp Grain & Vegetable LLC on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0143	PPL002738	Grower Contract between PPH and Brandel Farms LLC on December 26, 2018				
JTX 0144	PPL002732	Grower Contract between PPH and BW Orchards LLC on December 10, 2018				
JTX 0145	PPL002726	Grower Contract between PPH and Crystal Valley Organics on December 11,2018				
JTX 0146	PPL002720	Grower Contract between PPH and Daly Orchard Company on December 04, 2018				
JTX 0147	PPL002714	Grower Contract between PPH and Eisenlohr Farms LLC on November 30, 2018				
JTX 0148	PPL002708	Grower Contract between PPH and Eugene Kokx Farms LLC on December 08, 2018				
JTX 0149	PPL002702	Grower Contract between PPH and Evans Farms on December 01, 2018				
JTX 0150	PPL002696	Grower Contract between PPH and Four Star Farms on December 03, 2018				
JTX 0151	PPL002690	Grower Contract between PPH and Gerald and Rusty LLC on December 08, 2018				
JTX 0152	PPL002635	Grower Contract between PPH and Veg Grass LLC on December 11, 2018				
JTX 0153	PPL002684	Grower Contract between PPH and Greiner Farms LLC on December 12, 2018			1	
JTX 0154	PPL002678	Grower Contract between PPH and Karen Longcore on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0155	PPL002672	Grower Contract between PPH and Lakeshore Farms Inc. on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0156	PPL002666	Grower Contract between PPH and Matt Williams on December 12, 2018			1	
JTX 0157	PPL002660	Grower Contract between PPH and Oomen Brothers Inc. on December 12, 2018			1	
JTX 0158	PPL002654	Grower Contract between PPH and Oomen Farms on December 11, 2018				
JTX 0159	PPL002744	Grower Contract between PPH and Red Barn Farms LLC on December 10, 2018			1	
JTX 0160	PPL002648	Grower Contract between PPH and Rennhack Orchards LLC on December 12, 2018			1	
JTX 0161	PPL002642	Grower Contract between PPH and Riley Orchards NC on December 12, 2018			1	
JTX 0162	PPL002629	Grower Contract between PPH and Wittkamp Grain & Vegetable LLC on December 12, 2018				
JTX 0163	000260-000263	Purpose Point Harvesting Itinerary - 2017				
JTX 0164	000218	Purpose Point Harvesting Itinerary - 2018				
JTX 0165	000090-000093	Purpose Point Harvesting Itinerary - 2019				
JTX 0166	000219	2018 Growers & Additional Worksite Locations for Purpose Point Harvesting				
JTX 0167	000221	Purpose Point Harvesting LLC - Additional Housing Information				
JTX 0168	000222	Piece Rate Schedule (Presumably for 2018 Harvesting Season)				
JTX 0169	000125-000150	List of Grower Worksites and their Addresses for 2019 Harvesting Season				
JTX 0170	000151-000185	List of Grower Worksites and their Addresses for 2018 Harvesting Season				
JTX 0171	N/A	Second Amended Complaint				
JTX 0172	N/A	Defendants' Answer to Second Amended Counterclaim				
JTX 0173	N/A	Defendants' Supplemental Initial Disclosures				
JTX 0174	N/A	Plaintiffs' Initial Disclosures				
JTX 0175	N/A	Plaintiff's Objections to Written Discovery				
JTX 0176	N/A	Defendants' First Interrogatories to Plaintiffs		1	1	
JTX 0177	N/A	Joint Statement of Material Facts			1	
JTX 0178	N/A	Plaintiffs' Responses to Defendants' RFAs	i		1	

Exhibit No./Letter	Exhibit Bates Number	Description	Offered By	Objection	Date Offered	Date Received
JTX 0179	N/A	Plaintiffs' Luis and Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Responses and Answers to Defendants' Discovery Requests				
JTX 0180	N/A	Defendants' First Set of Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents Discovery				
JTX 0181	N/A	First Settlement Conference Minutes (December 11 2023)				
JTX 0182	N/A	Defendants' Response to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories				
JTX 0183	N/A	Defendants' Response to Plaintiffs' First RFP				
JTX 0184	N/A	Defendants' First Amended Counterclaim				
JTX A	N/A	Plaintiff's Original Complaint				
JTX B	N/A	Plaintiff's Amended Complaint- Class Action w/ Exhibits A-F				
JTX C	N/A	Affidavit of Darwin Funtes Perez				
JTX D	N/A	Declaration of Luis Gomez-Echeverria				
JTX E	N/A	Declaration of Hervil Gomez Echeverria				
JTX F	N/A	Declaration of Julio Cesar Gomez-Moreno				
JTX G	N/A	Plaintiff's Answer to Defendant's Second Amended Counter Complaint				
JTX H	N/A	Declaration of Artemio Coronado Esteban				
JTX I	N/A	Declaration of Darwin Fuentes Perez				
JTX J	N/A	Declaration of Leonel Lopez y Lopez				
JTX K	PLA006410	Picture of the Lockers for the Workers				
JTX L	N/A	Luis and Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Response to Defendants' Request to Admit				
JTX M	N/A	Luis and Hervil Gomez-Echeverria's Response to Defendants' Interrogatories				
JTX N	N/A	and Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Responses to Defendants' Responses to Defendants' Request to Admit				
	N/A	Julio Cesar Gomez-Moreno, Darwin Fuentez Perez, Artemio Coronado Esteban, and Leonel Lopez y Lopez's Responses to Defendants' Interrogatories				
JTX P	N/A	Supplemental Responses for Hervil Gomez-Echeverria to Defendants' RFP #13		<u> </u>		
JTX Q	N/A	Supplemental Response for Luis Gomez-Echeverria to Defendants' Interrogatory #7				
UIXQ	1471	Supplemental response for East Comez Editorenta to Belondanto Interrogatory #1				
				1		
				1		
				1		